# Historic District Review Committee

## Staff Report
### August 10, 2009

## Action Item

**CAPP 2009-0012 Jespersen Residence: Detached Three-Car Garage, Dormer Enlargement, and Back Porch Construction in the Goose Creek Historic District. MCPI 458-302-108.**

**Background**

The subject property is a residence constructed in 1993 and located at 38134 Hunts End Place in the Hunts End subdivision. Approved under CAPP 1992-0007, the house is located in the Goose Creek Historic District. The house is a two story, side gable, brick-faced building with an asphalt shingle roof. The foundation is not differentiated from the walls above. A front gable, side loading, two-car garage with two gable dormers is attached to the east end of the symmetrical main block by a one-and-one-half story hyphen with one gable dormer. The house is built on ground that slopes away from the building to create a partially exposed basement in the rear.

The applicant proposes three major projects and two small projects:

1. The applicant proposes to build a detached garage just northeast of the existing house. It will have three garage doors across the front and an open port for a camping trailer (camper port) on the rear. It will be built to resemble a carriage house and will use the slope of the yard to create the space for the camper port. The applicant states that a row of mature pine trees will screen much of the view of the new garage from the neighbors to the east. Trees and shrubs between the location of the proposed garage and the street will help to screen the view from the public way.
2. A porch is proposed for the rear of the house to add outdoor living space. As evidenced by a rear door, this element was always intended for the residence but not constructed. It will not be visible from the road.
3. The two gable dormers above the garage will be converted into one, long shed roof dormer. This larger dormer will provide more closet space in the master bedroom.
4. The smaller projects include replacing the existing garage doors and vinyl siding.

According to the Zoning Administration Referral dated July 23, 2009, there are no zoning issues with this application. Zoning staff notes that the lot contains moderate and very steep slopes, but that it does not appear that these areas will be disturbed during construction of the detached garage. If these areas are disturbed, however, zoning staff notes that the applicant must observe Section 5-1508 of the 1993 Revised Zoning Ordinance.

**Analysis**

Detached Garage

The Loudoun County Historic District Guidelines: Goose Creek Historic District (Goose Creek Guidelines) state that any new outbuilding should be subordinate to the main building in scale, mass, and siting. Accessory structures should also be compatible with the style, character, roof slope, and materials of the primary building on the site. The most desired garage design is a detached garage that, if designed according to historic precedents, may have appropriate doors facing the street (Goose Creek Guidelines, Guidelines for Site Elements: Accessory Structures and Breezeways, Guidelines 2, 3.a., 5, p. 46-7).

A one-story, three-car detached garage with doors fronting the street is proposed just off the northeast corner and to the rear of the house. The front elevation will be 22' tall and 34'8" wide. The garage will be built into a slope, making the rear elevation taller than the front. Taking advantage of the increased height, a camper port incorporated beneath the main roofline will be located along the rear of the garage. It will be used for camper storage.

The height of the garage on the existing house is approximately 26'. Therefore, the location to the rear of the house and the lower height of the detached garage meet the Goose Creek Guidelines for subordinate siting and scale of the proposed accessory structure.

The garage will be a side gable building. Side gable roofs are the most common roof form in the Goose Creek Historic District. The pitch of the roof will be 8/12, matching the 8/12 pitch of the attached garage. Therefore, the roof form and pitch create a relationship with the main building, also meeting the Guidelines.

The roof will be standing seam metal roof manufactured on site. Standing seam metal is the most common roof material in the County. Traditional standing seam metal roofs are made by forming 17" wide metal sheets into pans with 1 ½" high sides, placing them side by side, and crimping them together (Goose Creek Guidelines, Guidelines for Existing Structures: Elements, Roof Form and Materials, Text, pg. 88; Materials and Maintenance, Text, pg. 90). A roof that is similar to these dimensions will meet the Goose Creek Guidelines.

The garage will be clad with concrete composite board and batten siding with 6" boards and 1" by 2" battens. The Goose Creek Guidelines state that it is acceptable for masonry buildings to have frame outbuildings (Goose Creek Guidelines, Guidelines for Site Elements: Accessory Structures and Breezeways, Guidelines 5, p. 47). Cementitious siding is appropriate for new construction if it is applied in a traditional pattern and has a smooth finish (Goose Creek Guidelines, Guidelines for New Construction: Materials, Guideline 7, pg. 80). Board and batten is a traditional siding type for accessory buildings. The proposed siding meets the Guidelines as long as it has a smooth finish.

The HDRC does not have purview over paint color; however, the Guidelines make recommendations as a reference for historic district property owners. The Guidelines recommend that accessory buildings should be painted a color that coordinates with the associated residence (Goose Creek Guidelines, Guidelines for Site Elements: Accessory Structures and Breezeways, Guideline 7, p. 47). The applicant has not decided a color for the garage, but proposes a beige or gray tone. This color will match siding proposed for the new dormer and side gable of the main block, which is now beige. The garage trim will be painted white. Coordinating the garage color with the residence follows the color recommendations made in the Goose Creek Guidelines. The applicant will bring paint chips for proposed color choices to the meeting.

The garage foundation will be concrete with brick veneer on the front and sides and parged concrete to the rear. The brick will match the existing house as closely as possible. Differentiating the foundation from the rest of the building is recommended in the Guidelines. Brick veneer, a material that will match the main building on the property, is an acceptable foundation cladding for new construction. The Guidelines recommend that all sides of the foundation be clad with the same material. Since the rear elevation is included inside the camper port and will not be visible unless in this part of the building, parging the rear elevation of the foundation is an appropriate foundation treatment (Goose Creek Guidelines, Guidelines for New Construction: Foundations, Guidelines 2, 5, and 7, p. 76).

The three garage doors will be Clopay, insulated steel with composite overlay, carriage-style doors from the Coachman Collection. Matching doors will replace the existing doors in the attached garage. The proposed garage doors appear to open as double doors, but are overhead doors. The style relates to a late-19$^{th}$ century carriage house and is more sympathetic to the Goose Creek Historic District than modern garage doors. Composite doors with a design such as the one proposed are appropriate for new construction in the district (Goose Creek Guidelines, Guidelines for New Construction: Doors, Windows, and Shutters, Guidelines 5, and 7, p. 72). Relating the new garage with the house by matching the garage doors also meets the Guidelines. This style of door is also appropriate for a front loading garage.

A side door will be a Therma-Tru steel six-panel door. This door will not be visible from the road. The preferred material for doors is wood, however composite materials are considered for new construction based on design and appearance. A wood or composite door in the six-panel style is preferred, but since the steel door will not be visible from the public way, it is an acceptable substitute material (Goose Creek Guidelines, Guidelines for New Construction: Doors, Windows, and Shutters, Guideline 7, p. 72).

Simple trim, as depicted in the plans on pages A1.3 and A1.4, should be applied to all door surrounds. The profiles should match those traditionally found in the Goose Creek Historic District. A composite material is appropriate for the trim as long as it has a smooth finish and can be worked in the traditional manner of wood (Goose Creek

Guidelines, Guidelines for New Construction: Doors, Windows, and Shutters, Guideline 6, p. 72; Materials and Textures, Guideline 6, pg. 80).

The camper bay will have square 8" by 8" fiberglass columns with capitals and bases. The Goose Creek Guidelines allow substitute materials as long as they are compatible with and replicate the visual qualities and workability of historic materials. Wood, however, is the preferred material for such elements and follows historic precedents (Goose Creek Guidelines, Guidelines for New Construction: Materials and Textures, Guidelines 6 and 9, pg. 80). Since the posts will be located on the rear of the building, this substitute material is acceptable as long as it resembles the visual qualities and workability of wood.

Rear Porch

The Loudoun County Historic District Guidelines: Goose Creek Historic District (Goose Creek Guidelines) state that new porch designs should reflect the size, materials, proportions, and placement of historic porches in the rural areas. Additionally, porches on secondary elevations are appropriate to shield the house from the summer sun (Goose Creek Guidelines, Guidelines for New Construction: Front and Rear Porches, Guidelines 2 and 3, p. 74).

The applicant proposes to construct a porch on the rear of the house. It will not be visible from the street. The main section of the porch will be 18' by 23' and under roof. It will be located on the rear of the attached garage section. Access to the porch will be via a small 12'6" by 6'6" section. A smaller 6'8" by 6'6" section will step down from this section and lead to steps into the rear yard. Both small sections will not be under the porch roof.

Adding a porch to the rear of a house in the Goose Creek Historic District meets the Guidelines for porch locations. Constructing a porch, rather than a deck, on this modern house is also the preferred method of creating outdoor living space in historic districts.

The existing grade to the rear of the house and the location of the rear door precludes the construction of a porch in a different location on the rear of the house. However, the slope away from the attached garage will create a large space beneath the porch.[1] The submitted plans do not show how this space will be addressed. Additionally, the elevation on page A2.3 showing the rear of the porch shows that the joist ends will be exposed. Staff requests that the applicant provide more information on the rear porch elevation, including how the end of the porch floor and the space beneath the porch and the ground will be finished. Staff recommends that a header board be applied to the joist ends and painted lattice be installed beneath the porch to create a more finished appearance.

[1] Pages A2.2, A2.4, and A2.5 of the plans depict steps surrounding the covered porch. The applicant no longer proposes these steps because the grade is too steep. A metal railing is proposed instead.

The roof will be hipped with a flat central section, similar to a Mansard roof. The hipped section will be covered with standing seam metal and have a 12/12 slope. The flat section will be covered with torch down roofing, also known as rubberized asphalt. This roof type is not typical of the Goose Creek Historic District. Porch roofs are typically low-angled and are full hipped or shed roofs (Goose Creek Guidelines, Guidelines for Existing Structures: Elements, Roof Form and Materials, Text, 88). Since this porch will be on the rear of this new house and not visible from the road, staff finds that this roof type is acceptable. Still, the applicant may want to consider a more typical roof type for the rear porch. Staff recommends that the HDRC discuss this issue during the meeting.

Standing seam metal is the predominant roof material in Loudoun County; therefore, this proposed roof material meets the Goose Creek Guidelines as long as it is manufactured in the dimensions noted in the Detached Garage section (Goose Creek Guidelines, Guidelines for Existing Structures: Elements, Roof Form and Materials, Text, pg. 88; Materials and Maintenance, Text, pg. 90). Since the flat roof will not be visible, the torch down roofing is an acceptable material. However, if the applicant alters the design of the porch roof, then covering the entire roof with standing seam metal is the preferred alternative.

The floors and beaded ceiling will be constructed of mahogany.[2] Wood is the preferred material for porches in the Goose Creek Historic District and meets the Guidelines (Goose Creek Guidelines, Guidelines for Materials: Wood, Text; Inappropriate Treatments 2, p. 130).

The columns will be 8" x 8" fiberglass posts.[3] The plans show that the posts will be finished with a plain square capital and base. The Goose Creek Guidelines allow substitute materials as long as they are compatible with and replicate the visual qualities and workability of historic materials. Wood, however, is the preferred material for porch elements and follows historic precedents (Goose Creek Guidelines, Guidelines for New Construction: Materials and Textures, Guidelines 6 and 9, pg. 80). Staff requests more detail on the proposed dimensions of the post capitals and bases. The proposed fiberglass posts should have visual qualities and workability similar to wood to meet the Guidelines.

The proposed porch railing is iron and manufactured by Shenandoah Iron Works. The railing is decorated with a narrow strip of repeating circles along the top of the balusters. In Loudoun County's historic districts, metal is not typically used for porch railing. The Guidelines recommend against introducing metalwork for details, such as railings, where there is no historic documentation of their use. The Guidelines for New Construction also state that metal should only be used as a roof covering (Goose Creek Guidelines, Guidelines for Materials: Metal, Text; Inappropriate Treatments 2, p. 130; Guidelines for New Construction: Materials and Textures, Inappropriate Treatments 10, pg. 79). Metal porch railings are not characteristic of the rural area of the Goose Creek

[2] Page A2.3 of the plans states incorrectly that the floor will be Trek decking.
[3] The Statement of Justification incorrectly states that the posts will be mahogany.

Historic District. Furthermore, they are typically found in more formal locations, such as adorning a front porch or a public building. The use of a wood balustrade, perhaps with turned posts, would be more in keeping with the rural setting and location to the rear of the house.

Transoms screens are proposed for the porch. The Statement of Justification states that the transom screens will "repeat the transom design at the front door." The Goose Creek Guidelines recommend that new porches "show a clear architectural relationship to the structure" (Goose Creek Guidelines, Guidelines for Existing Structures: Porticos, Front and Rear Porches, Guideline 4, pg. 113). Historically, porches had a cornice beneath the roof, but they did not have transom screens. Repeating a front door transom detail on a rear porch is not characteristic of traditional porches or necessary to relate the porch to this new brick residence with a simple, yet formal, design.

The porch will have retractable screens manufactured by Liberty Screens. Tracks for the retractable screens that will be either 1" or 2" wide will be installed on the sides of each porch post. This minor modern detail will minimally affect the appearance of the rear porch, while adding flexibility to its use.

Dormer Expansion

One large shed dormer 32' long is proposed to replace two existing smaller gable roof dormers on the east slope of the garage roof. The dormer will extend from the peak of the attached garage wing. The roof will be standing seam metal and have a 6/12 slope. Windows in the dormer will be Andersen 400 Series casement windows similar to those in the existing dormers. The size and shape will be varied to add interest to the long wall created by the shed dormer. Board and batten cement composite siding is proposed for the dormer. The roof will be standing seam metal.

The Goose Creek Guidelines suggest that dormers be scaled proportionately to the building and the roof masses and that the roof pitch match the main roof pitch (Goose Creek Guidelines, Guidelines for New Construction: Roof Features, Guidelines 2 and 3, p. 67). Shed roof dormers typically begin at the gable roof line as proposed. This will allow for a steeper roof slope and more interior headroom than if the dormer began in the middle of the roof. The roof slope on the attached garage is 8/12 and the proposed dormer is 6/12. It is impossible to match the slope of a shed roof dormer with the slope of the roof; therefore, this solution of similar slopes is acceptable. Still, the mass and scale of the shed dormer will be significantly larger than the two existing dormers.

The careful use of materials will help mitigate the mass of the expanded dormer and relate it to the house. Maintaining the same roof material, tan asphalt shingles, on the dormer rather than installing a standing seam roof is one way to blend the proposed shed dormer into the existing building.

Additionally, using windows matching the predominant window type in the residence will help reduce the visual mass of the shed dormer and blend it into the existing residence. Currently, Andersen 400 Series casement windows are proposed as two sets of paired

28” by 48” windows flanked by 16” by 26” windows. Wood vinyl clad windows meet the Guidelines for windows in new construction. This arrangement will also create visual interest as noted in the Statement of Justification.

Nonetheless, the Goose Creek Guidelines for new construction recommend using windows with true or simulated divided lights that match the style of the building (Goose Creek Guidelines, Guidelines for New Construction: Doors, Windows, and Shutters, Guidelines 9 and 10, p. 73). Although the dormers had casement windows originally, the remainder of the house, including the remaining gable roof dormer, has 4/1 simulated divided light double hung windows, some in a paired configuration. Furthermore, double hung, rather than casement, windows are characteristic of houses in the Goose Creek Historic District. Therefore, staff finds that paired double hung windows with simulated divided lights matching the predominant window type on the house would be a more appropriate window treatment for the proposed dormer. A consistent window type would visually connect the new dormer with the existing house. Adding a central paired window to the dormer would also add visual interest and break up the long dormer wall.

The board and batten cement composite siding is proposed to create visual continuity between the house and the new detached garage. However, board and batten siding is typically found on outbuildings or residences of a more modest style. The existing siding on the dormers and the gable end of the main block is a composite beaded clapboard siding. It is consistent with the more formal style of this brick-faced symmetrical residence. Therefore, maintaining and continuing the use of the existing beaded siding is more appropriate for the expanded dormer and gable end. At the same time, the beaded siding will create a visual continuity between the proposed shed dormer and the existing residence that will help mitigate the mass of the dormer.

The window trim will be a simple 5/4” by 4” cement composite board surround. The Guidelines recommend using traditional trim profiles with dimensional qualities that match trim materials in the Goose Creek Historic District (Goose Creek Guidelines, Guidelines for New Construction: Doors, Windows, and Shutters, Guideline 11, p. 73). The proposed window trim meets this guideline.

**Findings**

1. *The detached garage is subordinate in size, scale, and location to the residence.*
2. *The detached garage is compatible in style; roof, siding, and foundation materials; garage doors; and roof pitch to the residence.*
3. *The steel door and the fiberglass columns proposed for the garage are not visible from the road.*
4. *The use of a porch, rather than a deck, and its location to the rear of the house is appropriate to the district and is not visible from the road.*
5. *The Mansard-like roof and the screen transoms proposed for the rear porch are not typical of porches in the Goose Creek Historic District.*

6. *The wood porch floor and ceiling meet the Guidelines for materials.*
7. *The standing seam metal roof material for the detached garage and rear porch meets the Guidelines for materials.*
8. *Board and batten siding is not a typical siding type found on residences of this simple, yet formal, style. The existing beaded siding is more appropriate for the expanded dormer and gable end.*
9. *The 4/1 simulated divided light, double-hung windows are the defining window type in the residence.*
10. *Using materials that match the existing house, including an asphalt shingle roof, 4/1 simulated divided light, double-hung windows, and beaded composite siding, will help mitigate the mass of the shed dormer and visually blend it with the existing residence.*

**Recommendation and Conditions**

Staff recommends approval of the application with the following conditions:

1. The dimensions of the standing seam metal roof should closely match traditional dimensions (17" wide sheet formed into pans with 1 ½" high sides).
2. The cementitious composite board and batten siding has a smooth finish.
3. Trim around the detached garage doors should be made of wood or a composite material that can be worked in the manner of wood. The trim profiles should match trim profiles characteristic of Goose Creek.
4. The fiberglass porch columns and detached garage camper port columns replicate the visual qualities and workability of wood.
5. A header board is applied along the rear of the porch to hide the floor joists and create a more finished appearance.
6. The area beneath the porch be finished with an appropriate material, such as painted lattice, to hide the area beneath the porch.
7. The porch balustrade be made of wood, not metal.
8. The dormer roof material be asphalt shingle, matching the roof on the existing residence.
9. The dormer and gable end siding remain beaded composite siding with a smooth finish.
10. The dormer windows be similar in style to the 4/1 simulated divided light, double-hung windows characteristic of the residence.

**Suggested Motions**

1. *I move that the Historic District Review Committee approve Certificate of Appropriateness 2009-0012 for the detached three-car garage, dormer enlargement, and back porch construction at 38134 Hunts End Place in*

*accordance with the Loudoun County Historic District Guidelines for the Goose Creek Historic and Cultural Conservation District based on the following findings (see findings above)….and the following conditions….*

2. *I move that the Historic District Review Committee approve Certificate of Appropriateness 2009-0012 for the detached three-car garage, dormer enlargement, and back porch construction at 38134 Hunts End Place in accordance with the Loudoun County Historic District Guidelines for the Goose Creek Historic and Cultural Conservation District based on the following findings…(see findings above).*
3. *I move alternate motion…*